
SL/HL 446/346

Food Fights and Water Wars:

Sacramental Controversies in the early 16th Century

Dates: January 10-12 and 17-18, 2011

Time: 9:00am-12:00pm, 1:30pm -4:30pm

Instructor: Dr Gordon Jensen, Lutheran Theological Seminary
Office: Room 226. Phone: 966-7866
Email: gordon.jensen@usask.ca

Course Description:

As the fledgling reformation movements took root, one of the main areas of disagreement among the reformers was the understanding of the two sacraments that had not been discarded by them; Baptism and the Lord's Supper. The different understandings of these sacraments reveal the different theological presuppositions of the reformers. In this course, we will cover the debates from the beginning of the reformation to the signing of the Wittenberg Concord of 1536.

First, we will explore the food fights (over the sacrament of the altar) between Luther, Zwingli, Oecolampadius, and Bucer, will be explored, including the major treatises beginning in 1526, written by Zwingli, Oecolampadius and Luther, and culminating in the Marburg Colloquy of 1529. The developing convergence between Bucer and Luther on the Lord's Supper will also be explored, which led to the 1536 Wittenberg Concord. Second, we will explore some of the water fights (over the sacrament of Baptism), including the growing Anabaptist movement beginning in 1525. The primary readings will be source materials in translation, and should be completed before the seminars begin.

Student Outcomes:

By the end of this section of the course, students will be able to:

1. Describe the main points in the understanding of the sacraments according to Martin Luther, Huldrych Zwingli, Johann Oecolampadius, Martin Bucer and the Anabaptists, and articulate the implications of these views for contemporary parish ministry.
2. Explain the historical and theological reasons for the failure of the Marburg Colloquy of 1529 and the apparent original success of the Wittenberg Concord of 1536.

3. Articulate what theologians meant by 'real presence' and 'spiritual' presence and the implications for their understanding of the incarnation and what happens in the sacraments.
4. Explain the pastoral implications of the differences between the reformers over the Sacrament of the Altar, and the Sacrament of Baptism.

Required Texts:

*Martin Bucer, "Selected Writings of Martin Bucer over the Lord's Supper," Translated by Gordon A. Jensen, et. al., (n.p. 2009).

*Balthasar Hubmaier, "On the Christian Baptism of Believers," *Balthasar Hubmaier: Theologian of Anabaptism*, Translated and Edited by H. Wayne Pipkin and John H. Yoder. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1989, pp. 95-149.

Martin Luther, "Concerning Rebaptism, 1528," *Luther's Works: American Edition*, Volume 40, Church and Ministry II," Edited by Conrad Bergendoff, General Editor Helmut T. Lehmann. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1958, pp. 225-262.

Martin Luther, "Confession Concerning Christ's Supper, 1528," *Luther's Works: American Edition*, Volume 37, 'Word and Sacrament III.' Edited by Robert H. Fischer, General Editor Helmut T. Lehmann. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1961, pp. 151-372.

Martin Luther, "Part Four, Baptism," and "Part Five, The Sacrament of the Altar," in *The Large Catechism*, *The Book of Concord: The Confessions of the Evangelical Lutheran Church*. Edited by Robert Kolb and Timothy J. Wengert. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2000.

Martin Luther, "That These Word of Christ, 'This is My Body,' etc., Still Stand Firm Against the Fanatics, 1527," *Luther's Works: American Edition*, Volume 37, 'Word and Sacrament III.' Edited by Robert H. Fischer, General Editor Helmut T. Lehmann. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1961, pp. 3-150.

Martin Luther, "The Marburg Colloquy and the Marburg Articles, 1529," in *Luther's Works: American Edition*, Volume 38, Word and Sacrament IV. Translated and Edited by Martin E. Lehmann, General Editor Helmut T. Lehmann. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1971, pp. 3-89.

*Huldrych Zwingli, "On the Lord's Supper," in *Zwingli and Bullinger*, Volume XXIV, The Library of Christian Classics. G.W. Bromiley, Translator and Editor. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1953, pp. 176-238.

*Huldrych Zwingli, "An Exposition of the Faith" (selections), in *Zwingli and Bullinger*, Volume XXIV, The Library of Christian Classics. G.W. Bromiley, Translator and Editor. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1953, pp. 239—244, 254-65.

*Huldrych Zwingli, "Of Baptism," in *Zwingli and Bullinger*, Volume XXIV, The Library of Christian Classics. G.W. Bromiley, Translator and Editor. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1953, pp. 119-175.

N.B. for documents indicated with an asterisk, (*), please talk to professor about access.

Assignments:

1. **Class Participation (10%).** This course is a senior level and graduate level course, and it is designed as a seminar style course with major input by the students. Students are expected to have completed the readings before they are discussed in class, and will be able to answer basic questions at the beginning of each class period relating to the assigned readings. Students will also be graded according to their participation in class discussions.
2. **Leading a class discussion (30%).** Each student will choose a reading or a section of reading and be prepared to lead a class discussion on the material by creating either a series of theses for discussion or questions for discussion. The students should be prepared to give the historical background of the material as well as outline in some detail the arguments utilized by the author. An evaluation of the author's argument should also be given. While the focus should be on the historical and theological material, some reflections on contemporary implications or challenges should also be offered. The student should hand in an outline of their presentation to the professor the day before their discussion is scheduled. Engaging the other students in discussions on the section is highly encouraged. **(Note: Those taking this course for graduate credit will be expected to lead 2 class period discussions, worth 25% each)**
3. **Research Paper (60%).** Those taking the course for MDiv, BTh or MTS credit should hand in a 20-25 page paper, double spaced, 12 point font, 1" (2.54cm) margins, with proper footnoting and bibliography. **(Those taking the course for graduate credit (STM) should hand in a 30 page paper following the above criteria, and it will be worth 40%. The lower weight for the paper allows for a greater focus on leading class discussion and the preparation required for two separate presentations).**

This paper will focus on one particular argument or historical document, and explore what was at stake, how the reformers addressed the situation, and the effectiveness of their argument. The paper should also draw out some contemporary implications and parallels and whether the reformers' ideas are helpful in the present context. Please present your paper proposal to the professor before writing the paper. This paper is due by **March 25, 2011**.

Basic Working Bibliography:

- Althaus, Paul. *The Theology of Martin Luther*. Translated by Robert C. Schultz. (Philadelphia: Fortress Press), 1966.
- Baker, J Wayne, "Church, State and Dissent: The Crisis of the Swiss Reformation, 1531-1536," *Church History*, 57 no 2 (June 1988), pp. 135-152.
- Bayer, Oswald. *Martin Luther's Theology: A Contemporary Interpretation*. Translated by Thomas H. Trapp. (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2007).
- Brauer, James L., editor. *Worship, Gottesdienst, Cultus Dei: What the Lutheran Confessions Say About Worship*. (St. Louis: Concordia Publishing House, 2005).
- Cross, Richard, "Alloiosis in the Christology of Zwingli," *Journal of Theological Studies*, NS 47 no 1 (April 1996), pp. 105-122.
- de Kroon, Marijn. "Martin Bucer and the Problem of Tolerance," *The Sixteenth Century Journal*, Vol. 19, No. 2 (Summer, 1988), pp. 157-168.

- Empie, Paul C., and McCord, James I., *Marburg Revisited: A Re-examination of Lutheran and Reformed Traditions*. (Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1966).
- Friesen, Abraham, "Acts 10: The Baptism of Cornelius as Interpreted by Thomas Müntzer and Felix Manz," *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, 64 no 1 (Jan 1990), pp. 5-22.
- Gerrish, Brian A., "Discerning the Body: Sign and Reality in Luther's Controversy with the Swiss." *Journal of Religion*, 68 no 3 (July 1988), pp. 377-395.
- Gerrish, Brian A., "Lord's Supper in the Reformed Confessions," *Theology Today*, 23 no 2 (July 1966), pp. 224-243.
- Green, Lowell C., "What was the True Issue at Marburg in 1529." *Springfielder*, 40 (September 1976), pp. 102-106.
- Greschat, Martin. *Martin Bucer: A Reformer and His Times*. Translated by Stephen E. Buckwalter (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2004).
- Hillerbrand, Hans Joachim, "Andreas Bodenstein of Carlstadt, Prodigal Reformer." *Church History* 35 no 4 (December 1966), pp. 379-398.
- Hubmaier, Balthasar, "Dialogue with Oecolampad on Infant Baptism," *Balthasar Hubmaier: Theologian of Anabaptism*, Translated and Edited by H. Wayne Pipkin and John H. Yoder (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1989), 275-295.
- Hubmaier, Balthasar, "Dialogue with Zwingli's Baptism Book," *Balthasar Hubmaier: Theologian of Anabaptism*, Translated and Edited by H. Wayne Pipkin and John H. Yoder (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1989), 166-233.
- Hubmaier, Balthasar, "Old and New Teachers on Believers Baptism," *Balthasar Hubmaier: Theologian of Anabaptism*, Translated and Edited by H. Wayne Pipkin and John H. Yoder (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1989), 245-274.
- Hunsinger, George. *The Eucharist and Ecumenism: Let us Keep the Feast*. Current Issues in Theology. (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008).
- Karlstadt, Andreas Rudolf, "Karlstadt's Dialogue on the Lord's Supper," *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, 53 no 1 (Jan 1979), pp. 35-77.
- Kittelson, James M., "Ecumenism and Condemnation in Luther and Early Lutheranism," *Lutheran Quarterly*, N.S. Vol 3, No. 2 (Summer 1989), pp. 125-139.
- Loewen, Harry. *Luther and the Radicals. Another Look at Some Aspects of the Struggle Between Luther and the Radical Reformers*. (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1974).
- Lohse, Bernhard, *Martin Luther's Theology: Its Historical and Systematic Development*. Translated and Edited by Roy A. Harrisville. (Edinburgh: T & T Clark, and Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1999).
- Mildenberger, Friedrich, *Theology of the Lutheran Confessions* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1986)
- Peters, Edward F., "Luther and the Principle: 'Outside of the Use, There is No Sacrament,'" *Concordia Theological Monthly*, 43 No. 11 (1971), pp. 643-52.
- Pipkin, H Wayne, "The Baptismal Theology of Balthasar Hubmaier," *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, 65 no 1 (Jan 1991), pp. 34-53.
- Prenter, Regin. "The Doctrine of the Real Presence," *Lutheran Quarterly*, 3 no 2 (May 1951), pp. 156-66.

- Quere, Ralph W., "Changes and Constants: Structure in Luther's Understanding of the Real Presence in the 1520's," *Sixteenth Century Journal*, 16 no 1 (Spring 1985), pp. 45-78.
- Rainbow, Jonathan H., "'Confessor Baptism': The Baptismal Doctrine of the Early Anabaptists." *American Baptist Quarterly*, 8 no 4 (December 1989), pp 276-290.
- Rempel, John D., *The Lord's Supper in Anabaptism: a study in the Christology of Balthasar Hubmaier, Pilgram Marpeck, and Dirk Philips*. Studies in Anabaptist and Mennonite History, No. 33 (Scottsdale, PA: Herald Press, 1993).
- Sasse, Hermann. *"This is My Body": Luther's Contention for the Real Presence in the Sacrament of the Altar* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1959).
- Scaer, David P., *Baptism*. Confessional Lutheran Dogmatics, Vol. XI. John Stephenson, editor (St. Louis, The Luther Academy, 1999).
- Shantz, Douglas H, "The Crautwald-Bucer Correspondence in 1528 : A Family Feud within the Zwingli Circle," *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, 68 no 1 (Jan 1994), pp. 79-94.
- Steinmetz, David C., "Scripture and the Lord's Supper in Luther's Theology," *Interpretation*, 37 no 3 (July 1983), pp. 253-265.
- Stephenson, John R., *The Lord's Supper*. Confessional Lutheran Dogmatics, Vol. XII. John Stephenson, editor (St. Louis, The Luther Academy, 2003).
- Strehle, Stephen. *"Fides aut foedus: Wittenberg and Zurich in Conflict over the Gospel," Sixteenth Century Journal*, 23 no 1 (Spring 1992), pp. 3-20.
- Tappert, Theodore G. *The Lord's Supper: Past and Present Practice* (Philadelphia: Muhlenberg Press, 1961).
- Thompson, Nicholas. *Eucharistic Sacrifice and Patristic Tradition in the Theology of Martin Bucer, 1534-1546*. Studies in the History of Christian Traditions, No. 119. (Boston: Brill. 2005).
- Trigg, Jonathan D. *Baptism in the Theology of Martin Luther*. Studies in the History of Christian Thought, Vol. 56 (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1994).
- Walton, Robert C., "Was there a turning point of the Zwinglian Reformation," *Mennonite Quarterly Review*, 42 no 1 (Jan 1968), pp. 45-56.
- Word Council of Churches, *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1982).

Class Schedule:

NOTE: Period 1: 9:00am-10:20am; Period 2: 10:40am-12:00noon;
Period 3: 1:30pm-2:50am; Period 4: 3:10am-4:30am.

Date	Period	Topic/Readings	Presenter
January 10	1	Introduction to course; Expectations	Dr G. Jensen
	2	History of the Sacrament of the Altar debates	Dr. G. Jensen
	3	Zwingli: "On the Lord's Supper"	
	4	Luther: "That These Words of Christ, 1527" pp. 3-78	
January 11	1	Luther: "That These Words of Christ, 1527" pp. 78-150	
	2	Discussion: Luther, Zwingli, and Oecolampadius, Round 1	ALL
	3	Luther: "Confession Concerning Christ's Supper" pp. 163-252	
	4	Luther: "Confession Concerning Christ's Supper" pp. 252-360	
January 12	1	Discussion: Luther, Zwingli, and Oecolampadius, Round 2	ALL
	2	Marburg Colloquy, 1529:	
	3	Zwingli: "An Exposition of the Faith" Luther: "Part 5, Large Catechism"	
	4	Discussion: Luther, Zwingli and Oecolampadius, Round 3	ALL
January 17	1	Luther and Bucer: Theological development and convergence, 1530-1536	Dr G. Jensen
	2	The Wittenberg Concord of 1536	Dr G. Jensen
	3	Discussion: The Lord's Supper Debates: Round 4	ALL
	4	History of the Sacrament of Baptism Debates	Dr G. Jensen
January 18	1	Zwingli: "Of Baptism"	
	2	Hubmaier: "On the Christian Baptism of Believers"	
	3	Luther: "Part Four, Large Catechism" and "Concerning Rebaptism"	
	4	Discussion: The Sacrament of Baptism Concluding Reflections	ALL